

**SUPREME COURT OF PENNSYLVANIA
CIVIL PROCEDURAL RULES COMMITTEE**

Proposed Recommendation No. 242

**Proposed Amendment of Rule 1006(a.1) Governing
Venue in Medical Professional Liability Actions**

The Civil Procedural Rules Committee proposes that Rule of Civil Procedure 1006(a.1) governing venue in medical professional liability actions be amended as set forth herein. The proposed recommendation is being submitted to the bench and bar for comments and suggestions prior to its submission to the Supreme Court of Pennsylvania.

All communications in reference to the proposed recommendation should be sent no later than **October 30, 2009** to:

**Karla M. Shultz, Esquire
Counsel
Civil Procedural Rules Committee
5035 Ritter Road, Suite 700
Mechanicsburg, Pennsylvania 17055**

**or E-Mail to
civil.rules@pacourts.us**

The Explanatory Comment which appears in connection with the proposed recommendation has been inserted by the Committee for the convenience of the bench and bar. It will not constitute part of the rules of civil procedure or be officially adopted or promulgated by the Court.

Rule 1006. Venue. Change of Venue

(a) Except as otherwise provided by subdivisions (a.1), (b) and (c) of this rule, an action against an individual may be brought in and only in a county in which

(1) the individual may be served or in which the cause of action arose or where a transaction or occurrence took place out of which the cause of action arose or in any other county authorized by law, or

Note: For a definition of transaction or occurrence see *Craig v. W. J. Thiele & Sons, Inc.*, 395 Pa. 129, 149 A.2d 35 (1959).

(2) the property or a part of the property which is the subject matter of the action is located provided that equitable relief is sought with respect to the property.

(a.1) Except as otherwise provided by subdivision (c), a medical professional liability action may be brought against a health care provider for a medical professional liability claim only in a county in which the cause of action arose. This provision does not apply to causes of action that arise outside Pennsylvania for which jurisdiction properly exists in Pennsylvania.

Note: See Section 5101.1(c) of the Judicial Code, 42 Pa.C.S. § 5101.1(c) for the definitions of “health care provider,” “medical professional liability action” and “medical professional liability claim.”

(b) Actions against the following defendants, except as otherwise provided in subdivision (c), may be brought in and only in the counties designated by the following rules: political subdivisions, Rule 2103; partnerships, Rule 2130; unincorporated associations, Rule 2156; corporations and similar entities, Rule 2179.

Note: Partnerships, unincorporated associations, and corporations and similar entities are subject to subdivision (a.1) governing venue in medical professional liability actions. See Rules 2130, 2156 and 2179.

(c)(1) Except as otherwise provided by paragraph (2), an action to enforce a joint or joint and several liability against two or more defendants, except actions in which the

Commonwealth is a party defendant, may be brought against all defendants in any county in which the venue may be laid against any one of the defendants under the general rules of subdivisions (a) or (b).

(2) If the action to enforce a joint or joint and several liability against two or more defendants includes one or more medical professional liability claims, the action shall be brought in any county in which the venue may be laid against any defendant under subdivision (a.1).

(d)(1) For the convenience of parties and witnesses the court upon petition of any party may transfer an action to the appropriate court of any other county where the action could originally have been brought.

(2) Where, upon petition and hearing thereon, the court finds that a fair and impartial trial cannot be held in the county for reasons stated of record, the court may order that the action be transferred. The order changing venue shall be certified forthwith to the Supreme Court, which shall designate the county to which the case is to be transferred.

Note: For the recusal of the judge for interest or prejudice, see Canon 3C of the Code of Judicial Conduct.

(3) It shall be the duty of the prothonotary of the court in which the action is pending to forward to the prothonotary of the county to which the action is transferred, certified copies of the docket entries, process, pleadings, depositions and other papers filed in the action. The costs and fees of the petition for transfer and the removal of the record shall be paid by the petitioner in the first instance to be taxable as costs in the case.

(e) Improper venue shall be raised by preliminary objection and if not so raised shall be waived. If a preliminary objection to venue is sustained and there is a county of proper venue within the State the action shall not be dismissed but shall be transferred to the appropriate court of that county. The costs and fees for transfer and removal of the record shall be paid by the plaintiff.

(f)(1) Except as provided by paragraph (2), if the plaintiff states more than one cause of action against the same defendant in the complaint pursuant to Rule 1020(a), the action may be brought in any county in which any one of the individual causes of action might have been brought.

(2) Except as otherwise provided by subdivision (c), if one or more of the causes of action stated against the same defendant is a medical professional liability claim, the action shall be brought in a county required by subdivision (a.1).

Explanatory Comment

Currently, a lawsuit based on medical treatment furnished in another state cannot be brought in Pennsylvania even if the defendants have substantial contacts with the state whereas Pennsylvania defendants can be sued in any state in which they have at least minimum contacts. The amendment to subdivision (a.1) would eliminate this discrepancy.

By the Civil Procedural
Rules Committee

Stewart L. Kurtz
Chair